

Deadline of Submission of Public Comments:
Document:

11-Nov-18
ASB BPR 031: Standard for Report Writing in Bloodstain Pattern Analysis

Note: a specific Proposed Resolution must accompany each comment or it cannot be considered.

#	Section	Type of Comment (E-Editorial, T-Technical)	Comments	Proposed Resolution	Final Resolution
1	4.1 Preamble	T	modified or supplementary report	When it is mentioned: ... "Any corrections or additions to the original report shall be identified and issued as amended or supplemental report" ... technically, it corresponds to place <modified report>, not since if it is placed <complementary report> that means that this <modification> is taken into account or not. It does not give the character of mandatory, it is a <complement>, because, even in the <peer review> the analyst could also NOT TAKE IT. When in fact if it is a modification of the original report, that modification should appear as such and not with the term <complementary>	Accept with modification: comment was addressed by separating into two bullets additions and corrections to a report.
5	4.2 (4.2.1, 4.2.2, 4.2.3, 4.2.4)	T	Reporting element recommendations may be different from what is required by accrediting bodies	As in 4.28 methods - add a statement "Accredited agencies shall follow the standards outlined for reporting elements as described in the scope. Agencies that are not accredited shall include the the following elements: "	Reject: There is no know conflict with accreditation guidelines. It is the accrediting agency's choice as to which standard they follow.
2	4.2.5 Case Information	T	a summary is necessary	It is recommended that in the case of reporting the alteration of a photograph, beyond placing what was the modification, you should place the check sum of the original image and the modification. It is a short step and allows you to quickly verify the integrity of the image in both cases. Even that, in the columns of the checklist you can place a box in which the page number of the report in which it is found and quickly find it. Then, both in the "peer review" or during the trial, you can give a reading to that quick list and the lawyers or the court can deepen the point of interest during the debate.	Reject: The summary would be unnecessarily prescriptive and the consensus body feels it is appropriate as written.
6	4.2.6.3	T	This information may included in the case record and not required in the report	The date and manner of receipt of items should be included in the report and/or case record	Accept with modification: it reads now as "4.2.6.3 The date and manner of receipt of items shall be included in the report or case record."
7	4.2.7	T	"The report shall identify the locations where examinations took place" There is not a need to indicate that each item was examined at the laboratory	Change shall to should or preface sentence with "When testing in not performed at a laboratory,"	Accept with modification: see "The report shall identify the locations where examinations took place when not performed at the analyst's agency/laboratory. "
8	4.2.8	T	"The report should..."	"The report and/or case record should..."	Reject: This information belongs in the report.
9	4.2.10.1	T	"The report shall..." Many agencies contain this information in the case record and only report conclusions in the report. Having redundant information in the case record and case report could lead to unnecessary errors and is not efficient.	"The report and/or case record shall..." or state according to accreditation standards	Reject: This information belongs in the report.
10	4.2.10.4	T	"Measurements utilized for calculations such as area of origin shall be included in the report."	report and/or case record	Accept with modification: see "Measurements utilized for calculations such as area of origin shall be included in the report or case record."
3	4.2.10.5 Photographs	T	Any alteration to photographs	It is recommended that in the case of reporting the alteration of a photograph, beyond placing what was the modification, you should place the check sum of the original image and the modification. It is a short step and allows you to quickly verify the integrity of the image in both cases.	Accept with modification: Any alteration to photographs utilized in a report shall be maintained in the case record.
11	4.2.10.6	T	"If used, these shall be identified and referenced in the report." Is this necessary if you are on scene and your sketch is included in your case record. All examination notes make up the conclusions in the report	"If used or generated, these shall be included in the report and/or case record"	Accepted with Modification: "Sketches— If sketches, scene diagrams, or floor plans are used as a basis for conclusions, they shall be identified and referenced in the report. Sketches may be annotated."
12	4.2.11.1	T	shall be included in the report	shall be included in the report and/or case record	Reject: This information belongs in the report.
13	4.2.11.4	T	This is too specific as to how agencies should keep track of the samples collected and prepared. The process shouldn't be different for samples generated for BPA than samples generated for other analyses.	The location(s) of stain sample(s) collected by the analyst, shall be reported with reference to their unique identifier(s) and/or documented in the case record.	Accept with Modifications: Section revised to read: "The location(s) of stain sample(s) collected by the analyst, if not recorded elsewhere, shall be reported with reference to their unique identifier(s)."
14	4.2.12	T	"When rendering case conclusions, the report shall include the findings drawn from the analysis and be based upon the information and observations previously presented in the report"	"...presented in the report and/or case record"	Reject: This information belongs in the report.
4	4.3	T	The statement reads: "Reports should be issued prior to providing expert testimony". This should be a mandatory requirement. It forces the analyst to put in writing what he can testify to before actually going to court.	Repac the word "should" with the word "shall".	Reject: Various circumstance might prevent the issuance of a report prior to testimony.
15	4.3	T	All reviewer(s) and dates of review should be noted in the report. Reports should be issued prior to providing expert testimony. - Having the report issued prior to testimony supports having the analysis peer reviewed	"...should be noted in the report and/or case record" "Reports shall be issued..."	Reject: See comment #4

#	Section	Type of Comment (E-Editorial, T-Technical)	Comments	Proposed Resolution	Final Resolution
26	CB comment		<p>I am voting against the report writing document, because I think it is naive with respect to crime scene reconstructions facilitated or partially facilitated through bloodstain pattern interpretation. I urge members of the ASB to revisit this issue. I don't see how a "one size fits all" template can deal with the extreme variability and complexity of real-world crime scene reconstructions. It appears that only fairly simple examples involving the assignment of the causes of resulting patterns from a consideration the possible mechanisms producing them was being considered at the time this was approved. Crime scenes encountered in actual case work are commonly much more complex. In practice, rarely does the problem solution lie solely with monolithic blood deposit configuration considerations. In my opinion in developing this document further we should evaluate what we produce with actual case examples.</p>		<p>Commenter withdrew negative comment based on resolutions to public comments.</p>
27	CB comment		<p>I have concerns regarding several of the "For example" statements.</p>		<p>Commenter withdrew negative comment based on resolutions to public comments.</p>