Deadline of Submission of Comments: 13-Oct-25
Document Number: ASB Std 078
Document Title: Standard for Training in Forensic Autosomal Short Tandem Repeat (STR) and Y-STR DNA Data Interpretation and Comparison

Comment #	Text Line # (s)	Document Section	Type of Comment E-Editorial T-Technical	Current Document Wording	Proposed Revision	Revision Justification	*For Working Group and Consensus Body use only, not to be completed by commenter.* Final Resolution
1		Foreword	E	minimum requirements	delete minimum	we voted to delete minimum from the Scope; should also be deleted from the Foreword	Accept
2		3.11	T	The relative ratio of two peaks at a given locus. Mathematically, the ratio may be calculated in two ways: 1) The shorter peak (or area) divided by the taller peak height (or area). This is commonly expressed as a percentage. 2) The peak height (or area) of the longer length allele divided by the peak height (or area) of the shorter length allele.	The relative ratio of two peaks at a given locus. The shorter peak (or area) divided by the taller peak height (or area). This is commonly expressed as a percentage.	Supporting documentation could not be located showing that labs (US, Canada, European) currently use this inverse method. It results in a value larger than 100%. Also, consider removing the parenthesis for the word area. If peak or area can be used, the parenthesis doesn't seem necessary.	Reject: The standard gives two options and both are correct
3	99	4.2.1		minimum	delete "At a minimum,"	we voted to delete minimum from the Scope; should also be deleted here; if the requirement is met, it's irrelevant if there is more that was required in their program	Accept
4	121	4.2.6		minimum	delete "At minimum,"	we voted to delete minimum from the Scope; should also be deleted here; if the requirement is met, it's irrelevant if there is more that was required in their program	Accept
5	177	4.3.2	E	minimum	delete "At a minimum,"	we voted to delete minimum from the Scope; should also be deleted here; if the requirement is met, it's irrelevant if there is more that was required in their program	Accept
6		4.3.2	E	At a minimum, the practical portion of the training program shall include the observation of a trained analyst performing activities representative of the range, type, and complexity of DNA data from routine casework or database samples processed by the laboratory, at least once or until clearly understood.	At a minimum, the practical portion of the training program shall include the observation of a trained analyst performing activities representative of the range, type, and complexity of DNA data from routine casework or database samples processed by the laboratory, at least once or until demonstration by the trainee that the material is completely and clearly understood.	A trainee could clearly understand the material but not be able to demonstrate that they understand. It is important add demonstrate to this section.	Reject: The demonstration is accomplished with the competency portion. Additionally 4.3.4 discusses the trainee's ability to demonstrate.
7	181	4.3.3	E	minimum	delete "At a minimum,"	we voted to delete minimum from the Scope; should also be deleted here; if the requirement is met, it's irrelevant if there is more that was required in their program	Accept
8		4.4.3 c	E	accurately operate relevant equipment, instrumentation, and software as stated in the laboratory's protocol for forensic autosomal and Y-STR data interpretation and comparison protocol(s);	accurately operate relevant equipment, instrumentation, and software as stated in the laboratory's automsomal and Y-STR interpretation and comparison protocol(s)	Cleaner sentence for the modification	Accept
9		Bibliography d		d Available from: http://media.wix.com/ugd/4344b0_da25419ba2dd4363bc4e5e8fe7025882.pdf	use reference to swg website for the up to date version	this link takes you to an outdated version of this document	Accept
10		Bibliography	E		add NIST Mixture Foundational review; Butler, J.M., et al. (2024) DNA Mixture Interpretation: A NIST Scientific Foundation Review. (National Institute of Standards and Technology, Gaithersburg, MD), NIST IR 8351. https://doi.org/10.6028/NIST.IR.8351; https://nvlpubs.nist.gov/nistpubs/ir/2024/NIST.IR.8351.pdf (sept 16 2025)	very important document for DNA data interpretation and comparison	Accept
11			T	none	Requirement to review and evaluate comparison of evidence profile data to elimination databases	This is a critical component of data interpretation and comparison that is not present in this document. Perhaps add a requirement under Quality Control Indication (2.6.1) or under 4.2.6.2 somewhere.	Reject: Not part of the redlined portion