

Deadline of Submission of Comments: 11-Sep-23

Document Number: ANSI/ASB Std 079

Document Title: Standard for Training in the use of Combined DNA Index System (CODIS)

#	Section	Type of Comment (E-Editorial, T-Technical)	Comments	Proposed Resolution	Final Resolution
	Forward	E	The aim is to provide a framework for quality training that will result in consistency in the forensic DNA community.	The aim is to provide a framework for quality training resulting in consistency within a laboratory and in the forensic DNA community.	Accept
	Scope	E	consistency across training documents	This standard outlines the minimum requirements to be met in a training program for...	Accept
1	3.2	E	space between 'An' and 'acronym' needed	An acronym'	Accept
3	3.2	T	SDIS Definition does not include offender profiles being stored at SDIS	Include offender profiles in definition of SDIS	accept with modification, deleted "containing DNA offender profiles from LDIS laboratories"
10	3.2	E	There is a typo in the redlined portion.	Correct the typo: "Anacronym" to "Acronym."	Accept with modification. Spacing issue fixed, now reads "An Acronym"
15	3.3	E	"And " in last line should be "or".	See comment	Reject, a laboratory could analyze all types
	3.5	E	the phrasing is awkward for this definition. Recommend deleting "unknown" and "profiles from" since the words do not add meaning to the definition and adds a level of confusion since the profile is certainly "known" but the source is unknown and a relative is being potentially identified, not the profile	delete "unknown" and "profiles from" (or otherwise modify the definition to say "An additional search in a DNA database of a forensic profile from an unknown individual to identify potential biological relatives ")	Accept
16	3.6	E	The grammar is incorrect..	After "investigation" it should read, "where one or more of the case(s) involved in the '1' match is (are) unsolved".	Reject, used definition from NDIS procedures manual
17	3.8	E	Grammar - it is ok to end sentences with a preposition sometimes, but not in this instance.	Suggested rewording: "The classification assigned to a DNA record that designates the indices in which the DNA record will be stored and searched (e.g., convicted offender or forensic unknown)."	Accept
2	4.1	E	Separate into two sentences and remove the because	ANSI/ASB Standard 022, Standard for Forensic DNA Analysis Training Programs shall be used in conjunction with this document. ANSI/ASB Standard 022 provides the foundational training program requirements upon which additional specific requirements, such as this document, will be based.	Reject, wording is consistent across all the training standards
	4.2.1	G	added for consistency across all training documents	literature on the effects of cognitive bias in decision-making processes associated with forensic DNA reporting and review.	accept
	4.2.2	E	there is no 4.2.2.8 or 9	deleted and ended sentence with "the following topics." for consistency with other training documents	Accept
	4.2.2.1	E	should "topics" be after "the following"? it doesn't read correctly where it is; the word "topics" is used in 4.2.2 and thus applies to all subsections so unnecessary to repeat	move "topics" to the end of the statement or simply delete the word	Accept with modification, changed to "including:"
	4.2.2.2-4.2.2.7	E	delete "topics" - unnecessary and reads awkwardly; the word "topics" is used in 4.2.2 and thus applies to all subsections	delete "topics"	Accept with modification, changed to "including:"
4	4.2.2.4 d)	E	"indexes that search each other" - confusing terminology	Phrase "indexes searched" is used in references to NDIS search parameters	Accept

5	4.2.2.4	T	No mention of "loci searched / not searched" in search parameters section	Include loci are searched / not searched as a search parameter	Accept with modification, added to e) "loci searched"
6	4.2.2.5	T	Evaluation of Candidate Matches - no mention of hit dispositions or Investigations Aided (CODIS metrics)	Include CODIS metrics in this section	Accept, added to a) "Managing CODIS metrics (ie., hit dispositions and investigations aided)"
11	4.2.2.5	T	4.2.2.5(a) indicates appropriately that training in the evaluation of candidate matches must include "potential for mismatches." However, it does not say explicitly that this this must include statistical differences in the likelihood of mismatches when candidate matches are derived from a database search.	Either revise section 4.2.2.5(a) or add a subsection noting the need for training in the statistical analysis of mismatch likelihoods using database searches.	Accept with modification, WG was unclear what commentor meant - WG reached out to commenter. "Language was changed to "evaluation of mismatches" in 4.2.2.5 c.
7	4.2.2.6	T	No mention of Partial Match	Add 'Partial Match' as a possible topic to cover, along with Familial Search	Accept with modification, 4.2.2.5 b) and c) added
	4.2.2.6	E	does the topic in a) need to be split into a) and b) to meet ASB guidelines?	a) the specific laboratory protocol; b) any state legislation, as applicable	Accept with modification, split into a) and b)
8	4.2.2.7	T	Many labs to not have Missing Person / Pedigree Tree programs; same for (g) Kinship Analysis	Make these sections 'as applicable'	Accept, added "as applicable" to 4.2.2.6 and 4.2.2.7
	4.2.2.7 c)	T	the word "technologies" probably covers mtDNA sequencing and NGS but no other test assays such as Y STRs or the use of miniSTRs, or Rapid DNA; suggest expanding options to be more inclusive of available test assays	suggest adding "tests" - to read: the necessity for additional tests or technologies	Accept
18	4.2.2.7 f	E	Begins with "the differences" but the rest of the sentence does not go on to indicate both categories or groups these differences are relevant to/observed between-- it only gives half of what should be there.	Suggested rewording: "f) the differences in terminology used in missing person cases compared with [insert]. "	Accept with modification, deleted "the differences in"
9	4.3 and 4.4.3	E	Practical Training and Practical Competency may not be appropriate at databank labs where analysts do not work in CODIS	Make these sections 'where applicable' or optional	Reject: This document is only for those using CODIS, so the proposed revision would not apply to those using this document. As stated in 4.3.3 "trainee's job responsibilities and the extent to which the trainee will participate in the use of CODIS."
12	4.3.	E	Sentence does not stand alone in context of this section and lacks specificity. Also, is the intention either/or? In other words, if the trainees requires only one observation of an experienced examiner in order to obtain the skills for the use of CODIS, will 4.3.2 not be required?	Suggested rewording: "If the practical instruction for the trainee to obtain the skills for the use of CODIS clearly is not understood as a result of 4.3.1, the trainee will then be presented with exercises representative of the range, type, and complexity of routine casework or database samples processed by the laboratory, as an additional training option."	Reject with modification: 4.3.2 was modified to clarify that both 4.3.2 and 4.3.3 are required.
19	4.3.2	E/T	A single observation is not enough to accomplish goals. There should be some way to determine whether the observing analyst had observed the process enough times to understand it (a test or similar). It appears that 4.3.2 is intending to qualify this by saying there must be enough observations completed by trainees to ensure that procedure is clearly understood. If this is the case, it should not be a separate section--it should continue the last sentence in 4.3.1 and the following sections should be re-numbered. Also, a word or words should be inserted after until since "the protocols" was removed (or perhaps reinsert the words "the protocols").	Suggested rewording: "4.3.1 The practical component of the laboratory's training program shall provide the trainee with sufficient practical instruction for the trainee to obtain the skills for the use of CODIS. The practical portion of the training program shall include the observation of a trained analyst performing the processes until the protocols are clearly understood for situations representative of the range, type, and complexity of routine casework or database samples processed by the laboratory, as demonstrated by a graded test of this knowledge. " or similar.	Reject with modification: 4.3.2 was modified to clarify that both 4.3.2 and 4.3.3 are required. The grading component is covered in section 4.4.
	4.3.2	E	the statement at 4.3.2 seems to be a continuation of 4.3.1 rather than a separate requirement	recommend deleting the numbers 4.3.2, and changing 4.3.3 to 4.3.2	Reject with modification: 4.3.2 was modified to clarify that both 4.3.2 and 4.3.3 are required.

13	4.3.3.	E	Either/or logic from 4.3.1 - 4.3.3. unclear. Is the minimum observing an experienced examiner (4.3.1) or hands on exercises (4.3.2)?	Either require all training steps, or delineate clearly what the minimum requirement is and how it is determined whether a trainee needs additional training (and what specifically that training is/should be).	Reject with modification: 4.3.2 was modified to clarify that both 4.3.2 and 4.3.3 are required.
14	4.4.1	E	The sentence structure needs to be edited.	Suggest rewording: "The trainee shall demonstrate knowledge based and practical competency in the use of CODIS via the competency component of the laboratory's training program."	Reject: The recommended modification does not provide additional clarification to the section.
20	4.4.2	E	"Training of" grammar	Suggested rewording: "The trainee shall successfully complete a knowledge-based test covering the critical information obtained during the training session addressing the use of CODIS. " or similar.	Accept with modification: "of" revised to "on" to clarify the intent of the sentence. 4.4.2 modified for consistency across all training documents in response to a comment for standard 78
	4.4.3				4.4.3 modified for consistency across all training documents in response to a comment for standard 78. sentence structure edited for consistency across all training documents.