

Deadline of
Submission of 15-Jan-24
Comments:
Document
Number: ANSI/ASB Std 091

Document Title: Standard for Training in Analysis of Forensic Short Tandem Repeat (STR) DNA Data

Comment #	Text Line # (s)	Document Section	Type of Comment	Current Document Wording	Proposed Revision	Revision Justification	For Working Group and Consensus Body use only, not to be completed by commenter.
			E-Editorial T-Technical				Final Resolution
		Forward		This standard defines the minimum required elements for a forensic DNA training program on ...	This standard defines the minimum requirements to be met in a forensic DNA analyst training program for ..."	consistency across training standards	accept
		Scope		This standard outlines the minimum requirements in training programs for analysis of ...	This standard outlines the minimum requirements to be met in a training program for ...	consistency across training standards	accept
		3.2	Editorial	The minimum height requirement at and above which detected peaks on a STR DNA profile electropherogram can be reliably distinguished from instrument background noise; peaks above this threshold are either artifacts or true alleles.	The minimum height requirement at and above which detected peaks on a STR DNA profile electropherogram can be reliably distinguished from instrument background noise; peaks above this threshold are generally not considered noise and are either artifacts or true alleles.	consistency across training standards	accept
2		3.9	Editorial	"...Productor..."	"...product or..."		accept
3		3.9	Ballot Comment	Found one spacing error - line 60 in 3.9; "productor" to "product or"			accept
4		3.9	Ballot Comment	Need in a space in "productor" in 3.9.			accept
5		3.9	Ballot Comment	Need a space in 3.9 between product and or.			accept
6		3.9	Ballot Comment	Please add a space in section 3.9 line 60 to read "product or"			accept
1	76	3.12	T	Fluorescence from unincorporated PCR primers present in all amplified DNA product that is detected before the sizing range in an electropherogram	Add a note after the definition to state "NOTE: Primer peaks may be diminished or absent following any post-PCR clean-up processes."	Post-clean up may produce e-grams with no primer peaks and provides understanding of a new trainee that they may not exist.	accept with modification, removed all
		3.19	T	A non-standard form of an allele due to a point mutation, an insertion or a deletion relative to other commonly seen alleles. NOTE May also be called off-ladder allele or microvariant.	A form of an allele due to a point mutation, an insertion or a deletion relative to other commonly seen alleles in the allelic ladder.	changes made based on comment on standard 78 for consistency across training standards.	accept
7		4.2.1	Editorial	"...in decision making..." and "analysis"	"...on decision making..." and "analyses"		reject, proposed resolution does not change clarity of the statement
		4.2.1 c	Editorial	literature that supports the laboratory's validation;	terature used to support validation;	consistency across training standards	accept
8		4.2.1 f)	Technical	This item seems too narrow in scope	Remove the second part of this item (i.e., "associated with analysis used for forensic STR DNA data")		Reject. It is important that the bias training be specific to the scope of this document.
		4.2.2			added "knowledge-based training component..." to match the other docs	consistency across training standards	accept
9		4.3.2	Technical	"...include the observation of a trained analyst performing the analyses at least once..."	Twice would be better than once since random chance may mean a lone correct analysis lucky. Actually the number of trials should probably be greater since the paragraph calls for a range of challenges and one or two trials is unlikely to cover a range of challenges that might be experienced. Or maybe the intent is to call for success and understanding across several challenges chosen to capture the range of what an analyst might be called on to do. In this case one challenge for each posed may be reasonable but it should be made clear that there will be multiple different challenges observed.		Accept with modification: 4.3.2 was modified in reponse to comments in standard 79 and for consistency across all training documents.
		4.4.2 and 4.4.3					(as defined by the laboratory's policy) added to 4.4.2 and 4.4.3 in all training documents for consistency in response to a comment in standard 78 and 80. sentence structure edited for consistency across all training standards.
		Annex A				7/8 CB meeting voted to add references to standards 20, 40 and STRbase	accept