

Deadline for 30-Sep-19
Document Number: ANSI/ASB Standard 116
Document Title: Standard for Training in Forensic DNA Quantification Methods

Note: a specific Proposed Resolution must accompany each comment or it cannot be considered.

#	Section	Type of Comment	Comments	Proposed Resolution	Final Resolution
6	Forward	E	"The aim is to provide a framework for quality training that will result in consistency in the forensic DNA community."	To be consistent with ASB 023 & 115, "The aim is to provide a framework for training that will result in quality and consistency in the forensic DNA community."	Accept
7	1	E	Add 'minimum' before 'requirements'.	"This document provides <i>minimum</i> requirements to ensure proper training in the methods of DNA isolation and purification used within the trainee's forensic DNA laboratory."	Reject: This scope was approved by the CB. The ASB submitted this to ANSI and the scope is consistent with other training documents.
1	4.2.3 e) 6)	E	DNA cannot be re-extracted; only the original evidence sample can have another portion tested; in this context "re-extracted" has no real meaning	suggest "...the DNA should be purified or concentrated, or if another portion of the sample should be extracted"	Accept with modification: "The sample should be" was added to the second part of this sentence. And additional modification of "...further concentrated, or the sample should be re-extracted;"
2	4.2.3 e) 6) & 7)	E	reverse the order of 6 & 7 to reflect process order	make 6) #7 and 7) #6 - reverse order	Accept.
5	4.2.3 f 3	T	Maintenance and calibration of equipment in some laboratories is managed and executed by an equipment team or support personnel. Training programs for analysts go over the basics of equipment operation for the procedure, and troubleshooting for awareness of impact on reported data, but not to the full extent of maintenance procedures that are conducted.	Consider adding verbiage to this section to state to include the topics as applicable to the extent of the analyst's responsibilities. Alternatively, adopt language from STD 023 for troubleshooting general equipment failure.	Reject: Please refer to section 4.2.3 of the Std 022 which is a normative reference and indicates the training program should be tailored to the specific duties of each trainee.
8	4.2.3 a-h)	T	If the aim of this document is to provide a framework for training that will result in quality and consistency in the forensic DNA community, then appropriate references should be provided for each topic so that at a minimum each laboratory is reviewing the same material.	It may be difficult to find relevant literature for each topic; therefore, to provide consistency, include a universal bibliography that will allow laboratories to review the same material for each topic.	Reject: The information contained in the bibliography indicates the list is not meant to be all inclusive. Each laboratory training program should have literature tailored to their needs.
12			I am voting Yes that there needs to be a standard for quant methods, but I do believe Melissa's comment about the Promega kit should be further investigated.		See resolution of comment #13.

13			<p>Promega's Plexor HY is not represented in the principles and limitations of quantitative PCR (qPCR) DNA quantification methods or Interpretation of results.

</p> <p>The technique is based on fluorescence quenching using modified bases and incorporation of a quencher opposite the modified base. For me this is different from the use of the term "specific probes". In addition melt curves are included in the interpretation of results.

</p> <p>It's been a long time since I last worked with the system so it may be appropriate to seek the help of a current user or Promega to ensure it is correctly represented in this document.</p>	<p>I would suggest the following additions:</p> <p>to 4.2.3.b</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PCR assays based on a reduction of fluorescent signal during amplification • The use of melting temperature (Tm) to assess specificity of the reaction <p>to 4.2.3.e</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evaluation of the melting temperature (Tm) 	Accept
9	4.3.3 b)	T	What if the DNA technicians performing the wet lab work are not being trained in data review/interpretation?	With the exception of evaluating the standard curve and NTC, a caveat should be included that not all individuals trained in wet lab work will be trained in data review/interpretation and the Training Program Administrator, or designee, shall evaluate controls and expected results.	Reject: This document is specific to a Forensic DNA Analyst program as indicated in the forward.
10	4.3.3 d)	T	If the aim of this document is to provide a framework for training that will result in quality and consistency in the forensic DNA community, then the minimum number and quality of samples needs to be defined.	To provide consistency, define the minimum 'appropriate' number and quality of samples that need to be processed by the trainee that will provide the trainee with 'sufficient' practical experience.	Reject: Defining a minimum number of training samples is not necessary if the comprehensive training program outlined in this Standard and in Standard 22 (normative reference) is followed.
3	4.4.3; opening paragraph	T	unclear what "known type" means when referring to quantitation	suggest "Samples of known concentration and degradation as well as known genotypes will be used."	Partial Accept: Sentence stating " samples of known type..." was deleted.
11	4.4.3	E	Replace 'as applicable' with 'at a minimum'.	The trainee shall be able to satisfactorily perform the following, <i>at a minimum</i> :	Partial Accept: Sentence was reordered to include "at a minimum".
4	Annex A, #3 reference	E	the date has an extra "1"	delete 1 from 20111	Accept