

Deadline of Submission of Comments: 18-Jul-25
Document Number: ASB BPR 129

Document Title: Best Practice Recommendations for Internal Validation of Human Short Tandem Repeat Profiling on Capillary Electrophoresis Platforms

Comment #	Text Line # (s)	Document Section	Updated Document Section	Type of Comment E-Editorial T-Technical	Current Document Wording	Proposed Revision	Revision Justification	For Working Group and Consensus Body use only, not to be completed by commenter.	
								Working Group Resolution	Final Resolution
1		3.7		E	n/a	add "PHR" with "Peak Height Ratio" definition	used in the recommendations	Accept	
2		3.13		E	spelling of "dropout" (2 mentions)	change to "drop-out"	for consistency - STD039 and definition 3.5 in both STD039 and BPR129 use "drop-out"	Accept	
3		3.13		E	Definition does not use hyphen in "dropout"	Stay consistent with 039 - which uses "drop-out"	While I am a hyphen user, either are fine, just stay consistent across and within documents	Accept	
4		4.1.11		T	"After studies are performed, an evaluation of the benefits should be conducted and criteria established...."	Add "and risks"	Risks as well as benefits should be considered.	Accept	
9		4.5.2	4.6.2	E	...the development of interpretation guidelines	change "guidelines" to "protocol"	to fit with Stnds 020 and 040 and language in 039 and elsewhere in 129	Accept	
5		4.7.3.2	4.8.3.2	T	"The lab should design the study to incorporate one additional contributor beyond the number expected...."	Change to "two additional contributors" OR suggest lab consider doing "two additional contributors" IF the result of the n+1 study indicate a need for it	High potential for erroneous NOC contributors when higher order NOC mixtures are present	Accept with modification; "...should design the study to incorporate at least one additional contributor..."	
6		4.7.4.3	4.8.4.3	T	should be evaluated in duplicate, at a minimum, or in triplicate, as best practice	should be evaluated in triplicate at a minimum	this is a BPR - it should be stating best practice; what is the point of stating "at minimum"? Triplicates are necessary in order to identify outliers - this is important and cannot be accomplished if only running in duplicate	Accept; the working group agrees that triplicate is best practice	
10		4.9.5.4	4.10.5.4	E	consumables etc.)	Add a comma before etc.	comma is grammatically needed	Accept	
7		4.10.1	4.2.1	E	Currently this standard is referenced last in sequence, however it is listed first in STD 039	Consider either moving it first (in order) as in the standard or move it to last in sequence in STD 039	match order of standards between STD and BPR	Accept, section 4.10 moved to 4.2.	
8		4.11.1		E	"assessment"	evaluation	consider using the word "evaluation" instead of "assessment"; assessment is used in an audit setting and may be causing confusion for that reason	Accept; the word assessment has been changed to evaluation throughout the document	
11		4.12.2		E	n/a	add NOTE referencing Standard 123 for additional information for routine evaluation of the protocols and its consistency of use in the laboratory	Std 123 provides guidance for fulfilling this step of the BPR	Accept	
12		Annex/ Bibliography		E	Standards contain "First Edition" and "year"	remove "First Edition" and date from all standards listed	these documents are currently undergoing the 5 year review; these versions will be out of date and irrelevant before the 5year anniversary of this document	Accept	
13		Annex/ Bibliography		E		Add 1) NIST DNA Mixture Interpretation Foundational Review; 2) User's Manuals and developmental validation publication(s) for kits, instruments and software; 3) NIST Forensic DNA and Human Factors; 4) OSAC DNA Testing Process Map	additional helpful information that should be cited	Accept with modification; items 1, 3, and 4 were accepted. Item 2 was not added as it would be difficult to be all inclusive	
14		Annex/ Bibliography		E		add standard 123	additional helpful information	Accept	
15		Annex/ Bibliography		E		add BPR 171	additional helpful information	Accept	
16				Ballot Comment	Minor revision: be consistent with dropout vs drop-out (use "drop-out" since that is what is used in standard 039). Minor revision to standard 4.2.4.5: lower case N letter for "non-specific".			Accept	