

Deadline of Submission of Comments:

Document Number:

Document Title:

20-Apr-20

ANSI/ASB Std 131

Standard for Training in Forensic DNA Sequencing using Capillary Electrophoresis

#	Section	Type of Com	Comments	Proposed Resolution	Final Resolution
18	General	T	There is a large amount of overlap between this standard and Std 130, some parts match word or word. It is unclear why these documents are separated when Std 115 for STRs combines amplification, separation, and detection.	The sheer number of training document are going to be overwhelming for laboratories (and auditors) to work with. When documents overlap to this degree, it seems the best thing to do is to combine into one document or make very clear the reason for separating and have each document reference the other.	Reject: Documents are being kept separate to be parallel with Standards 115, 116 and 023 that the ASB DNA CB is working on.
19	General	T	Many components of this proposed standard are already contained in proposed Standard 130. It is unclear what is significantly different about this standard to justify needing a separate stand alone standard and which specific and different capabilities each standard applies to. Furthermore, 131 seems to limit amplification to Sanger sequencing, while 130 seems more global. Additional clarification is needed. It may be beneficial to the laboratories and auditors to have this combined into one document if there are significant areas of overlap.	Either combine the two documents into one standard OR state more clearly in the Title, Foreword, Scope and Requirements what each document specifically covers and how the areas of apparent overlap differ or are the same criteria.	Partial Accept: The title and the scope of Standard 130 were modified to clarify the difference between Standard 130 and Standard 131.
20	General	T	Standard 115, which is ready to be published, is not referenced in this document at all. Many of the training requirements would be exactly the same as many are independent of STRs vs. Sequencing. Reconciling Standard 115, 130 and 131 would be extremely helpful to laboratories and auditors.	Standard 130 and 131 both need to be considered in reference to the existing Standard 115. Reference to 115 should occur where the requirements appropriately apply and specifics as they apply to sequencing should be detailed in sequencing specific documents. Unnecessary overlap will create confusion for the laboratories, auditors and future working groups editing/revising these standards as required.	Reject: Standard 115 is for training of forensic STR typing methods using PCR amplification, DNA separation, and allele detection, whereas Standard 131 is for forensic DNA sequencing using capillary electrophoresis. The content of these document does not overlap.
6	Title	E	While the title on the ASB pdf is correct (see Doc title above), the title on the ASB website is: "Standard for Training in Forensic DNA Sequencing using Capillary Electrophoresis Sequencing"	Ensure the last word ("Sequencing") is <i>not</i> present, as it is very redundant	Reject: Not applicable to the document. It was a typo on the ASB's website
7	Scope	E	The second sentence of the Scope mentions DNA amplification. This document is <i>not</i> about DNA amplification, it is about DNA sequencing using CE (this was probably erroneously copied from Standard 130)	Change to: "This standard applies to forensic human and wildlife mitochondrial DNA <i>sequencing using CE</i> , and wildlife nuclear DNA <i>sequencing using CE</i> (or spell out CE in both cases)	Accept
1	Scope	E	currently states that it is for amplification, not sequencing	replace "amplification" with "sequencing"	Accept
15	Table of contents	E	no page numbers	add page numbers	Reject: This document is a draft and page numbers will be added when this document is submitted for publication.
8	3.3	E	Sanger is a proper name	Capitalize sanger	Accept
9	3.3/3.X	E	Sanger/chain termination sequencing	"Sanger sequencing" does not actually appear in the document. Place 'chain termination sequencing' in the Terms, or otherwise correct the document	Accept: Sanger sequencing appears in section 4.2.3 a-1 -i.
16	Definitions and 4.2.3 a	E	Substantial material has been removed (E.g. MPS, Maxam-Gilbert sequencing, pyrosequencing) from the principles and limitations of sequencing methods (and the definitions section as well). These provide important context for Sanger sequencing, and are important for training for CE.	add back to definitions and section 4.2.3 a	Accept with modification: Definitions 3.3 and 3.4 were added to section 3 and 4.2.3. a was modified to include subsections 4.2.3. -a- 1) and 4.2.3 -a.1) i, ii, iii.

Deadline of Submission of Comments:

Document Number:

Document Title:

20-Apr-20

ANSI/ASB Std 131

Standard for Training in Forensic DNA Sequencing using Capillary Electrophoresis

#	Section	Type of Com	Comments	Proposed Resolution	Final Resolution
2	4.1	E	redundant, wordy	ANSI/ASB <i>Standard 022, Standard for Forensic DNA Analysis Training Programs</i> provides foundational training requirements for DNA analysts. It shall be used with this document, which outlines further specific requirements.	Accept
3	4.2.1	E	redundant, wordy. "Fundamental principles" and "theory" are arguably the same thing	"The laboratory's training program shall provide the trainee with an understanding of the fundamental principles behind CE sequencing,...."	Accept
4	4.2.2, 4.2.3	E	4.2.2 mandates the "training program shall require review of" and 4.2.3 mandates "the training program shall cover" . Is there a difference between coverage and review, or can these be merged under one heading?	Either better explain the difference intended between depth of coverage of these two sections, or merge 4.2.2 and 4.2.3 bullets under one heading (an expanded 4.2.2)	Reject. Format, wording, and requirements are consistent with Standards 023, 110, 115, 116
10	4.2.3 (Note)	E	References to historical methods (e.g. Maxim and Gilbert sequencing) have been removed, thus this note may no longer apply	Remove Note?	Accept with modification: The note was updated by removing the word "historical".
11	4.2.3 (etc.)	E	Capitalization consistency. For instance a) 1) - 3) are lower case, while d) 1) - 3) are upper case.	Make consistent throughout	Capitilization based on if items are a sentence or sentence fragment. ASB Staff will ensure consistency prior to publishing.
12	4.2.3 (etc)	E	Punctuation consistency. For instance a) 1) and 2) end with a semi-colon, while d) 1) and 2) end with a period.	Make consistent throughout	ASB Staff will ensure punctuation consistency prior to publishing.
13	4.2.3 g) 2)	E	sodium hypochlorite and bleach are the same thing.	Change to "sodium hypochlorite (bleach)" or remove one	Accept
14	4.2.3 g) 2)	T	see standard 130. Add UV cross-linking of consumables. Add UV of work surfaces (presumably hoods)	Make consistent with Standard 130	Accept
5	4.4.2	E	typo in "during the training of DNA sequencing using CE methods"	should be "during the training on DNA sequencing using CE methods"	Accept
17	references	E	Substantial input from current mitochondrial (human and wildlife) practitioners was obtained for which references should be included. Most have been removed, and are often replaced by irrelevant (databasing) or obsolete (20+ year old) references.	Update and improve references	Accept