

Deadline of Submission of Comments: 19-Jan-26

Document Number: ASB BPR 174

Document Title: Best Practice Recommendation for Age Estimation in Forensic Anthropology

Comment #	Text Line # (s)	Document Section	Type of Comment	Current Document Wording	Proposed Revision	Revision Justification	For Working Group and Consensus Body use only, not to be completed by commenter.
			E-Editorial T-Technical				Final Resolution
1	n/a	Foreword	E	As such, this document encourages continued research and scholarly debate to improve the scientific validity of estimating age.	As such, continued research and scholarly debate is encouraged to improve the scientific validity of estimating age.	nowhere in the document's text does it encourage research and debate. This is only mentioned in the foreword	Accept
2	4	Foreword	E	approaches ,	approaches,	Remove extra space	Accept
3	16-17	3.2	E	The estimation of chronological age from osseous, dental, or cartilaginous material, or a combination of these, reported as an interval	Replace "osseous, dental, or cartilaginous material, or a combination of these" with "skeletal"	Reduce redundancy as skeletal is defined in section 3.9 as "osseous, cartilaginous, and/or dental tissues"	Reject. Definition is retained as is to maintain consistency with ASB Technical Report 214, 1st Ed. 2026 - Forensic Anthropology: Terms and Definitions). Comment will be retained for editorial consideration.
4	16-17	3.1	T	The estimation of chronological age from osseous, dental, or cartilaginous material, or a combination of these, reported as an interval.	modify this definition or the one in draft standard 174	definition differs from that presented in draft standard 174	Reject. Definition is retained as is to maintain consistency with ASB Technical Report 214, 1st Ed. 2026 - Forensic Anthropology: Terms and Definitions). Comment will be retained for editorial consideration.
5	24	3.3	E	Growth and maturation of the dentition, including enamel mineralization, crown, and root formation.	Growth and maturation of the dentition, including enamel mineralization, crown formation, and root formation. Or Growth and maturation of the dentition, including enamel mineralization and crown and root formation.	sentence structure indicates "crown" is an indicator of growth/maturation.	Accept
6	33-36	3.5	T	documentation The record of observations and scientific data used to make interpretations and conclusions, including written descriptions (i.e., bench or analytical notes) and visual representations (e.g., photographs, diagrams/sketches, radiographs, casts, 3D scans).	replace with technical record and definition	why is a new term created for this document when others use "technical record" to indicate the same thing?	Reject. Technical record has not been used as a definition in any published ANSI/ASB document (is not listed in ASB Technical Report 214, 1st Ed. 2026 - Forensic Anthropology: Terms and Definitions) and is not in the OSAC Lexicon. Comment will be retained for editorial consideration when definition becomes published.
7	58-59	4.2.1	T	(i.e., fetal, infant/child, adolescent/young adult, older adult),	make changes here or elsewhere in the text to make categories consistent (adult vs older adult)	are these the only options? That is what "i.e." implies. If so, this document is internally inconsistent, as "older adult" is used here (and nowhere else) and "adult" is used elsewhere in the text	Reject with modification. "Older" was removed here to bring these categories into alignment with section 5.2. Fetal, infant/child, adolescent/young adult, older adult), are the categories used in ANSI/ASB Standard 133, 1st Ed. 2023, so they were used here for continuity. Comment will be retained for editorial consideration when definition becomes published.
8	58-59	4.2.1	E	fetal, infant/child, adolescent/young adult, older adult	fetal, infant/child, adolescent/young adult, adult	This change would mirror 5.2.	Accept
9	78	5.2	E	Analysts should assess what age group an individual likely belongs in to guide their selection of methods.	Analysts should assess the decedent's broad age category to guide their selection of methods.	awkward and internally inconsistent wording in the document text	Accept

10	80	5.2	E	NOTE Age groups, such as fetal, infant/child, adolescent/young adult, adult, represent	change groups to category	internally inconsistent wording in the document text	Accept
11	80	5.2	T	NOTE Age groups, such as fetal, infant/child, adolescent/young adult, adult, represent	see above suggestion for 4.2.1	Adult conflicts with limited categories defined in 4.2.1	Accept. Older adult in 4.2.1 was changed to adult, so the inconsistency with this note is no longer present.
12	80	5.2	E	NOTE Age groups, such as fetal, infant/child, adolescent/young adult, adult, represent	NOTE Broad age categories represent	these are defined above so no need to repeat.	Accept
13	80	5.2	T	NOTE Age groups, such as fetal, infant/child, adolescent/young adult, adult, represent broad developmental periods	NOTE Broad age categories represent life stages	Adult (or older adult if that is chosen to replace adult) is (largely) not a "developmental" period.	Accept with modification. "developmental periods" changed to "stages."
14	86	5.2.2	E	Infant and Child Age Estimation: Infant and child age estimation is based on dental	Infant/Child Age Estimation: Infant/child age estimation is based on dental	internally inconsistent text. why did this change from Infant/Child?	Accept
15	86	5.2.2	E	Infant and Child Age Estimation:	Infant/Child Age Estimation:	This change would mirror prior text.	Accept
16	86-88	5.2.2	T,E	Infant and Child Age Estimation: Infant and child age estimation is based on dental and skeletal indicators including dental development and eruption, diaphyseal dimensions of long bones, and appearance and maturation of ossification centers.	Infant/Child Age Estimation: Infant/child age estimation is based on dental and skeletal indicators including dental development and eruption, diaphyseal dimensions of long bones, appearance and maturation of ossification centers, or a combination of these.	sentence structure differs from 5.2.1, 5.2.3, and 5.2.4. why is a combination of these not applicable as it is for other age categories?	Accept. "or combination of these" has been added to 5.2.2. The inconsistency was the result of a change in the descriptions for other categories based on technical editor feedback ("or is apparently inclusive of all in the list or any combination of one or more in the list and is the preferred option", but we felt that this would not be clear to the average user).
17	87	5.2.2	T	diaphyseal dimensions	change 5.2.2 or 6.2.1 to make guidance consistent	internally inconsistent guidance. 6.2.1 says only for fetal and infant	Accept. "children" added to 6.2.1.
18	89	5.2.3	E	Adolescent/Young Adult Age Estimation: Adolescent and young adult age estimation	Adolescent/Young Adult Age Estimation: Adolescent/young adult age estimation	internally inconsistent text. why did this change from Adolescent/Young Adult?	Accept.
19	92	5.4.2 (comment on 5.2.4)	T,E	Adult Age Estimation: Adult age estimation is based on skeletal maturation, degeneration	make changes here or elsewhere in the text to make categories consistent (adult vs older adult)	This document is internally inconsistent, as "older adult" is used in 4.2.1 (and nowhere else) and "adult" is used elsewhere in the text (including 5.2)	Accept. 4.2.1 was modified to remove "older."
20	92	5.4.2 (comment on 5.2.4)	T	Adult Age Estimation: Adult age estimation is based on skeletal maturation, degeneration	clarify	this can be confusing. Maturation is the process of maturing, but if remains are skeletally mature (adult), they aren't continuing to mature, they are undergoing degeneration	Reject. In order to estimate whether someone is an adult, maturation must be assessed.
21	104	5.5.1	E	derive	develop	suboptimal word choice	Accept with modification. Derive changed to "construct" to avoid having develop and developers in the same sentence.
22	113-114	5.6	E	If multiple methods for an age indicator are available (e.g., pubic symphysis), a single method should be applied.	The sentence is unclear. What is meant by "multiple methods for an age indicator?"	Revise sentence for clarity.	Reject. The WG feels that the sentence is clear. No specific revision was provided.
23	117-118	5.8	T	The use of multiple age-estimation methods based on different regions of the body, or a method combining data from multiple regions is strongly recommended.	if the point of 6.5.2 is to say there are many possibilities, and the point of 5.8 is to say multiple is optimal, consider moving 5.8 to after 6.5.2 to clarify.	seems to conflict with 6.5.2	Reject with modification. 6.5.2 states that age CAN be estimated from a single method (e.g., in the case when you only have a single element), but 5.8 recommends the use of multiple regions when possible. 6.5.2 has been edited for clarity.
24	121	6.1	E	"The sections 6.2 through 6.5 provide..."	The sections 6.2 through 6.5 provide...	space needed between number and word	Accept
25	121	6.1	E	6.5 provide	add space: 6.5 provide	no space between 5 and p	Accept
26	125	6.2.1	T	The gestational age of fetal remains or age of infants can be estimated from metric measurements	change 5.2.2 or 6.2.1 to make guidance consistent	internally inconsistent guidance. 5.2.2 says for fetal, infant, and child	Accept. "children" added to 6.2.1.

27	131-133	6.3.1	T	The appearance and development of primary and secondary ossification centers can be used to age individuals in the fetal, infant, and child age groups. These features can be used along with epiphyseal/apophyseal fusion to age adolescents and young adults.	Change to avoid conflict with 6.3.2 and 6.3.6	What about late developing ossification centers (annular rings of vertebrae, medial epiphysis of clavicle, etc.)? This statement appears to disregard the importance of these in late adolescent/early adult remains and implies only the fusion is important. This also this conflicts with 6.3.2 and 6.3.6	Reject. Line 134 "these features" refers to "the appearance and development of primary and secondary ossification centers" that can be "used along with epiphyseal/apophyseal fusion to age adolescents and young adults." The WG finds no conflict with 6.3.2. and 6.3.6.
28	132	6.3.1	E	fetal, infant, and child age groups	fetal and infant/child age groups	This change would mirror prior text.	Accept.
29	133	6.3.1	E	adolescents and young adults	adolescents/young adults	This change would mirror prior text.	Accept.
30	138	6.3.2	T	Epiphyseal development and fusion can be particularly useful in older children, adolescents, and young adults	Change to avoid conflict with 6.3.1	See above comment. Conflicts with 6.3.1	Reject with modification. WG is unclear of what conflict exists with 6.3.1. Minor wording changes were made for consistency.
31	152	6.3.6	T	Evaluation of the developmental status of the acetabulum, spheno-occipital synchondrosis...	Change to avoid conflict with 6.3.1	See above comment. Conflicts with 6.3.1	Reject. The WG feels that no conflict exists. See comment resolution for #27.
32	165	6.4.2	T	retained	clarify	is this intended for all teeth present in the jaws (i.e., roots are not grossly visible) or just those that are unerupted?	Accept.
33	168	6.5	T	Adult	make changes here or elsewhere in the text to make categories consistent (adult vs older adult)	This document is internally inconsistent, as "older adult" is used in 4.2.1 (and nowhere else) and "adult" is used elsewhere in the text	Accept. 4.2.1 was modified to remove "older."
34	170	6.5.1	T	detention	dentition	incorrect word	Accept
35	171	6.5.1	T	maturation and degeneration. Age-informative structures that undergo maturational and	degeneration. Age-informative structures that undergo	this can be confusing. Maturation is the process of maturing, but if remains are skeletally mature (adult), they aren't continuing to mature, they are undergoing degeneration	Reject. [Need description here. - Same as comment #20]
36	173	6.5.1	E	regular and predictable compared to growth and development which necessitates wider (less	regular and predictable compared to growth and development, necessitating wider (less	grammar. As written could be interpreted as growth and development necessitating wide estimates	Accept
37	175	6.5.2	T	Age can be estimated from a single structure...	if the point of 6.5.2 is to say there are many possibilities, and the point of 5.8 is to say multiple is optimal, consider moving 5.8 to after 6.5.2 to clarify.	see comment above. Seems to conflict with 5.8	Rejection with modification. 5.8 (recommendation to use multiple areas) is an overarching statement for method selection in all age categories, so is necessary in Section 5. 6.5.2. was modified to reiterate the importance of using multiple areas/method whenever possible.
38	185	7.1	T	documentation	replace with technical record	why is a new term created for this document when others use "technical record" to indicate the same thing?	Reject. Technical record has not been used as a definition in any published ANSI/ASB document (is not listed in ASB Technical Report 214, 1st Ed. 2026 Forensic Anthropology: Terms and Definitions) and is not in the OSAC Lexicon.
39	186	7.2	T	documentation	replace with technical record	why is a new term created for this document when others use "technical record" to indicate the same thing?	Reject. Technical record has not been used as a definition in any published ANSI/ASB document (is not listed in ASB Technical Report 214, 1st Ed. 2026 Forensic Anthropology: Terms and Definitions) and is not in the OSAC Lexicon.
40	212	Annex A	E	(informative	(informative)	close parentheses	Accept

41	245, 256, 265, 271, 282, 286, 288, 290, 323, 325, 335	Annex A	E	multiple citations use et al	remove all instances of et al. and replace with full author list.	use full citations. Et al it is not uniformly applied and appears to dismiss the importance of some authors contributions	Accept. Citations updated.
----	---	---------	---	------------------------------	---	---	----------------------------